

# Analysis The Suitability Of Arabic Learning Videos On Youtube Based On The Gagne Model

Amanda Resti Maulidiya <sup>1</sup>

Asep Sopian <sup>2</sup>

<sup>12</sup> Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia

<sup>1</sup> amandarestiii@upi.edu

<sup>2</sup> asepsopian@upi.edu \*corresponding author

## Abstract

This study aims to analyze the extent to which Arabic learning videos available on YouTube adhere to Gagne's Nine Events of Instruction. The research employs a qualitative descriptive method with content analysis as the primary approach. A total of ten Arabic instructional videos were purposively selected and evaluated based on the presence of each of Gagne's instructional steps. The results show that only two out of ten videos fulfilled more than six of Gagne's stages, while the rest met only three to five stages. The most frequently observed stages were "presenting the stimulus" and "providing feedback," whereas key initial stages such as "gaining attention" and "informing learners of objectives" were frequently omitted. These findings suggest that most Arabic learning videos lack a structured instructional design, which may impact the effectiveness of learning. The study highlights the importance of incorporating a comprehensive instructional framework when designing educational content, particularly for language acquisition. It also emphasizes the need for content creators to be trained in instructional design principles. This research recommends the development of more pedagogically sound learning videos that fully implement Gagne's model to enhance the quality of digital Arabic language instruction.

**Keywords:** *Arabic language learning, Gagne's Nine Events, Instructional Design*

## Introduction

In recent years, digital technology has become a major driving force in educational transformation. One of the most widely used digital platforms in learning is YouTube. The platform not only provides quick and easy access to a wide range of teaching materials, but also allows for a more visual and interactive approach to learning (Ozsaban & Bayram, 2024; Pérez et al., 2020). Learning videos on YouTube can illustrate complex concepts, increase student engagement, and enrich the learning experience (Agazio & Buckley, 2009). In Indonesia, YouTube has become the most dominant social media in the dissemination of educational content, especially during the COVID-19 pandemic, when online learning was the main solution (Latifah et al., 2020; Coal & Coal, 2020). However, despite its widespread utilization, YouTube does not have a filtering mechanism that ensures the validity, quality, and suitability of uploaded learning materials (Sari, 2020; Setiawan et al., 2021). This poses its own challenges, as not all available learning videos meet the pedagogical standards required in the formal education process (Coal & Coal, 2020). Therefore, evaluating the feasibility of learning video content is very important, especially in ensuring the integration of the material with relevant learning theories.

The Gagné learning model is particularly relevant to be applied in the training of digital teaching materials for Arabic teachers because it provides a structured and systematic learning framework through nine main steps. These steps include attracting

participants' attention, informing goals, stimulating memory, presenting stimulus, providing tutoring, encouraging performance, providing feedback, assessing performance, and improving retention and knowledge transfer (Lo & Hsieh, 2020). This structure is in line with the stages of training activities carried out, such as needs analysis, focused discussions, training and workshops on making digital teaching materials, evaluation, and providing feedback, all of which are designed to improve teachers' ability to develop digital teaching materials according to the needs of students and the current learning context (Sopian & Tatang, 2023).

Gagné's approach also emphasizes the importance of analyzing learners' needs and adapting teaching materials to their characteristics, thus greatly supporting the training goal of creating relevant and easily accessible teaching materials both online and offline. In addition, Gagné's theory is also useful in evaluating the effectiveness of learning media, especially digital videos, because it helps identify how material is organized and delivered effectively in order to facilitate optimal student understanding and engagement (Handayani & Syafi'i, 2022). This is especially important in the context of learning Arabic, especially in the development of listening skills (*Maharah Istima'*), which is the initial foundation of language acquisition and supports the development of other skills such as speaking, reading, and writing (Wahyudin, 2020). Listening is not only listening, but also involves an active process in understanding and interpreting meaning, so that the use of audio-visual media such as learning videos is the right means. These media allow learners to have a more real and interactive learning experience, and with the application of Gagné's principles, the presentation of material in videos can be designed more effectively to strengthen learners' absorption of learning content (Fawzani et al., 2022).

Research by Handayani & Syafi'i, (2022) has shown the potential of learning videos in increasing the effectiveness of learning Arabic. For example, animated videos have been shown to significantly improve students' understanding of Arabic material compared to conventional methods. However, some studies have also revealed shortcomings, such as poor audio quality, less systematic content delivery, and inconsistency with certain curriculum or learning theories (Shawn & Shawn, 202; Lolang et al., 2023) Research that examines learning videos based on Gagné's theoretical framework is still very limited, so it is a research gap that needs to be filled.

This study aims to analyze the suitability of ta'aruf learning videos on YouTube with the 9-step Gagné learning model. The results of this analysis are expected to provide constructive recommendations for teachers, students, and educational content creators in selecting and developing learning videos that are in accordance with effective pedagogical principles.

## Method

This study uses a qualitative descriptive approach with content analysis techniques to evaluate the feasibility of ta'aruf-themed Arabic learning videos on YouTube from a pedagogical perspective. Assessment is based on the *Instructional Design Model — Gagné's Nine Events of Instruction* approach (Gagné, 1985), which emphasizes nine systematic stages in the learning process, from engaging students to evaluating learning outcomes. The inclusion criteria for videos in this study are: (1) videos in Indonesian or Arabic with a maximum duration of 15 minutes, (2) explicitly containing *ta'aruf* learning materials, (3) intended for beginner learners (basic level), and (4) published by educational channels or teachers/teachers. Meanwhile, the

exclusion criteria include: (1) non-educational videos, (2) videos that contain dominant ads, and (3) videos without audio narration. Videos were obtained through manual searches on YouTube with keywords such as "learning ta'aruf Arabic", "Arabic introductory materials for beginners", and "learning Arabic conversation *ta'aruf*". The *purposive sampling* technique was used to select 3–5 videos that were the most representative and in accordance with the Maharah *Istima' learning* indicators.

Data were collected through documentation studies and non-participant observations, by watching and recording the selected video content. Each video was then analyzed using a pedagogical assessment rubric based on nine learning stages according to Gagné, such as: (1) gaining attention, (2) informing learners of the objective, (3) stimulating recall of prior learning, (4) presenting the content, (5) providing learning guidance, (6) eliciting performance, (7) providing feedback, (8) assessing performance, dan (9) enhancing retention and transfer. The assessment rubric was prepared as a research instrument and is attached to table 2. Data analysis follows a model from Miles & Huberman, (1994) which consists of three stages: data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion/verification. The validity of the data is strengthened through triangulation between assessors and reflective discussions when differences in assessment occur. The content analysis approach follows guidance from Elo & Kyngäs (2008), which emphasizes systematic, interpretive, and repetitive categorization processes. This approach is expected to be able to provide an objective picture of the pedagogical feasibility of the theme learning video *ta'aruf* on YouTube, as well as presenting theory-based recommendations for the development of more quality educational content in accordance with the principles of effective learning.

## Results

This study analyzed 12 ta'aruf-themed Arabic learning videos available on YouTube, using pedagogical indicators based on *Gagné's Nine Events of Instruction* model. Each video was evaluated based on suitability for nine pedagogical elements, which include: Gaining Attention (GA), Informing Learners of Objectives (JOY), Stimulating Recall of Prior Learning (SRPL), Presenting Content (PC), Providing Learning Guidance (CF), Eliciting Performance (EP), Providing Feedback (PF), Assessing Performance (AP), and Enhancing Retention and Transfer (ERT).

The evaluation was carried out using an assessment rubric that had been prepared. The coding process and discussion are carried out to reduce subjectivity, as well as strengthen the validity of the assessment results. The data is presented in the form of a matrix to facilitate visual interpretation. The identities of the analyzed videos are presented in the following Table 1:

**Tabel 1.** Identity 12 Arabic Language Learning Videos

Video	Heading	Channel Providers	Video Link
V1	Arabic Learning Video Class VII Ta'aruf Material (Introduction) by Tauhidatul Istiqomah, S.Pd	MTsN 4 Days	<a href="https://bit.ly/42UoVuh">https://bit.ly/42UoVuh</a>
V2	Arabic Learning Video At- Ta'aruf Material or Introduction for Class VII MTs Odd Semester	B Nailah Izzah	<a href="https://bit.ly/44ikEDn">https://bit.ly/44ikEDn</a>

V3	Arabic Learning Video Class VII - Ta'aruf (Introduction)	Ayu Noer	<a href="https://bit.ly/4iJ69Mf">https://bit.ly/4iJ69Mf</a>
V4	Arabic Grade 7 Chapter 1 (Ta'aruf/Introduction)	Fadlan Abu Ahla (Islamic Travelling Video)	<a href="https://bit.ly/4iH0Z1D">https://bit.ly/4iH0Z1D</a>
V5	Arabic Online Learning for Grade 7 mts/junior high School Chapter 1 meeting 2    About ta'aruf (introduction)	Fatan Azka Official	<a href="https://bit.ly/3GQzeIm">https://bit.ly/3GQzeIm</a>
V6	Arabic Ta'aruf (Introduction) Grade 7 Junior High School	ALKAPRO TV	<a href="https://shorturl.at/cVNcW">https://shorturl.at/cVNcW</a>
V7	At-Ta'aruf (Introduction), Arabic Grade 7   MTs Al Irsyad Gajah	MTs Al Irsyad Gajah	<a href="https://shorturl.at/5u0vM">https://shorturl.at/5u0vM</a>
V8	Ta'aruf (Introduction) Arabic Grade 7 Chapter 1	Atifah Halas	<a href="https://shorturl.at/J6vzk">https://shorturl.at/J6vzk</a>
V9	Arabic Learning Video for Grade 7 MTs Chapter (التعارف) Introduction	Almar'atul Muttaqiyyah	<a href="https://shorturl.at/HlIEK">https://shorturl.at/HlIEK</a>
V10	Arabic Grade 7   التعارف (Introduction)   Vocabulary, Question Words, and Congratulations   KMA 183	Fadli Arabi	<a href="https://shorturl.at/ajuJl">https://shorturl.at/ajuJl</a>
V11	At-Ta'aruf (Self- Introduction)   Alqiroah   Arabic Grade 7 Chapter 1  KMA. 183	Fahimnaa Fahimtum	<a href="https://tinyurl.com/3c6pbp5k">https://tinyurl.com/3c6pbp5k</a>
V12	Arabic learning video about Ta'aruf grade 7	Aang Khoer	<a href="https://tinyurl.com/ycxk3kzw">https://tinyurl.com/ycxk3kzw</a>

An evaluation of the video's suitability with the nine elements of the Gagné model is shown in Table 2:

**Table 2.** 12 Video Match Matrix with Nine Gagné Elements

Video	GA	JOY	SRPL	PC	CF	EP	PF	AP	ERT
Video 1	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Video 2	✓	-	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Video 3	✓	-	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Video 4	-	-	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Video 5	-	-	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Video 6	✓	-	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Video 7	✓	-	-	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	✓
Video 8	✓	-	-	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	✓

Video 9	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Video 10	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	✓
Video 11	✓	✓	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Video 12	✓	-	-	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓

The results of the evaluation of twelve Arabic learning videos analyzed based on Gagné's nine instructional steps showed that most of the videos had met some important aspects in the delivery of the material, the use of language, and the provision of evaluations. However, there are still significant shortcomings in some key pedagogical aspects, particularly those related to the introduction of learning. Statistically descriptive, only one in twelve videos (Video 10) met the Stimulating Recall of Prior Learning (SRPL) aspect, which serves to associate new learning with previous experiences or knowledge. Meanwhile, only three videos (Videos 1, 9, and 11) met the Informing *Learners of Objectives* (ILO) aspect, which is the delivery of learning objectives at the beginning. This shows that most videos do not provide an adequate introduction to establish the context and expectations of the learner.

On the contrary, all videos managed to meet the Presenting Content (PC) aspect, which shows that the delivery of the content has been done quite well. Two other aspects that are also widely fulfilled are Providing Feedback (PF) and Assessing Performance (AP), each found in eleven of the twelve videos. This indicates that most videos have provided a form of feedback as well as an instrument to assess learners' understanding, both explicitly and implicitly.

In terms of pedagogical aspects, it can be seen that the most prominent shortcomings lie in SRPL and ILO. The absence of these two aspects in the majority of videos is an important issue, given that the relationship with the previous material and the clarity of learning objectives are foundational in the learner's cognitive process. This incompleteness can have an impact on the lack of optimal understanding and motivation of students.

In addition, there are also several notes related to the technical quality of the video. Videos 1, 4, and 5, for example, have low audio quality with background *noise* that is quite disruptive to the learning process. Video 8 has a backsound that is too loud and less relevant to the content of the material. Meanwhile, Video 11 relies only on material from e-books without any media variations or other visual approaches, which has the potential to reduce the appeal and effectiveness of learning. In general, it can be concluded that although the content of the material has been delivered quite well, there is a significant need to improve the introductory aspects of learning and the integration of the previous material. This evaluation is expected to be a constructive input for educational content developers in an effort to improve the quality of online learning that is effective, engaging, and in accordance with the principles of good instructional design.

## Discussion

Theory *Instructional Design Model* — Gagné's *Nine Events of Instruction* used as an analytical framework to assess the feasibility of Arabic learning videos on YouTube from a pedagogical perspective. This theory was first developed by Robert M. Gagné, an educational psychologist who introduced a systematic approach to the learning outcome-based learning process (Gagne et al., 1992). This model emphasizes that the success of learning is not only determined by the content of the material, but also by the way the material is organized and presented to students (Richey, 2000). Gagné argues

that learning is a process that involves the interaction between the internal conditions of the learner and the external stimulus provided by the media or teachers (Khadjooi et al., 2011). In this approach, Gagné devised nine stages referred to as *Events of Instruction* to help ensure that the learning process runs in a structured and effective manner (Berger-Estilita & Greif, 2020). The following is a summary of the interaction data of Arabic learning videos of *At-Ta'aruf* material:

**Tabel 3.** *Arabic Learning Video Interaction Data*

No	Heading	Account	Total Views	Number of Likes	Number of Comments
1	Arabic Learning Video Class VII Ta'aruf Material (Introduction) by Tauhidatul Istiqomah, S.Pd	MTsN 4 Days	3500	172	4
2	Arabic Learning Video At-Ta'aruf Material or Introduction for Class VII MTs Odd Semester	B Nailah Izzah	261	61	5
3	Arabic Learning Video Class VII - Ta'aruf ( Introduction)	Ayu Noer	178	16	-
4	Arabic Grade 7 Chapter 1 (Ta'aruf/Introduction)	Fadlan Abu Ahla (Islamic Travelling Video)	158	10	-
5	Arabic Online Learning for Grade 7 mts/junior high School Chapter 1 meeting 2    About ta'aruf (introduction)	Farhan Azka Official	1000	65	2
6	Arabic Ta'aruf (Introduction) Grade 7 Junior High School At-Ta'aruf (Introduction),	ALKAPRO TV	5100	125	81
7	Arabic Grade 7   MTs Al Irsyad Gajah	MTs Al Irsyad Gajah	47	2	-
8	Ta'aruf (Introduction) Arabic Grade 7 Chapter 1	Atifah Halas	118	11	1
9	Arabic Learning Video for Grade 7 MTs Chapter (التعارف) Introduction	Almar'atul Muttaqiyah	131	16	2
10	Arabic Grade 7   التعارف (Introduction)   Vocabulary, Question Words, and Congratulations   KMA 183	Fadli Arabi	1300	208	-
11	At-Ta'aruf (Self-Introduction)   Alqiroah   Arabic Grade 7 Chapter 1  KMA. 183	Fahimnaa Fahimtum	921	25	-
12	Arabic learning video about Ta'aruf grade 7	Aang Khoer	89	-	-

From the results of the analysis of user interaction data on the Arabic learning video of At-Ta'aruf material on YouTube, it can be seen that the success rate of the video in reaching the audience is not always in line with its pedagogical quality. For example, the video from the ALKAPRO TV channel was recorded as the most watched, reaching 5,100 views, but only received 125 likes. On the other hand, Fadli Arabi's video, which was only viewed 1,300 times, actually got 208 likes. This shows that even though a video

is popular in terms of the number of impressions, it does not necessarily have a high level of appreciation or pedagogical effectiveness.

Most of the videos analyzed in the table are uploaded by individuals or personal education activists, but some come from official accounts of educational institutions such as MTsN 4 Batang Hari and MTs Al Irsyad Gajah. Despite coming from a formal institution, MTs Al Irsyad Gajah videos only received 47 views, making them the video with the lowest reach. This data indicates that the popularity of videos is determined more by the distribution strategy and branding strength of the uploader account than by its institutional status. In terms of audience engagement, there is a striking variation. ALKAPRO TV's video not only had the highest number of views, but also recorded the highest number of comments as many as 81, indicating the existence of a discussion space or active participation from the audience. On the other hand, some other videos such as those uploaded by MTsN 4 Batang Hari, MTs Al Irsyad Gajah, and Aang Khoer have no comments at all, which could be due to the disabled comment feature or low user participation. This shows that the potential of interactive learning has not been maximized, especially from the feedback aspect.

When compared to the findings of previous studies, a similar pattern was also found in studies conducted by (Immanuel & Hameed, 2023), where educational videos on YouTube often don't meet instructional design principles across the board—especially in terms of active participation and feedback. Here's the order of views, likes, and comments from highest to lowest;

***Table 4.*** Order Number of Views, Likes, and Comments from Highest to Lowest

No	Total Views	Number of Likes	Number of Comments
1	Video 6	Video 10	Video 6
2	Video 1	Video 1	Video 2
3	Video 10	Video 6	Video 1
4	Video 5	Video 5	Video 5
5	Video 11	Video 2	Video 9
6	Video 2	Video 11	Video 8
7	Video 3	Video 3	Video 3
8	Video 4	Video 9	Video 4
9	Video 9	Video 8	Video 7
10	Video 8	Video 4	Video 10
11	Video 12	Video 7	Video 11
12	Video 7	Video 12	Video 12

Based on the data presented in Table 4, it can be seen that there is a difference in ranking between the number of views, the number of likes, and the number of comments on each Arabic learning video and the At-Ta'aruf material. Video number 6 occupies the top spot in terms of the number of views and comments, but it only ranks third in the number of likes. In contrast, the number 10 video has the highest number of likes, although it is only in third place in the number of views and the tenth in the number of comments. This suggests that even if a video gets a lot of views, it is not necessarily accompanied by other active interactions such as "*likes*" or comments.

The main findings of this table indicate that many videos neglect to facilitate aspects of user interaction, especially in the comment column, even though these interactions are important for learning Arabic, especially listening skills (*Maharah Istima'*). In a pedagogical context, according to *Gagné's theory of Instructional Design*, the

active participation of learners through practice (*Elicit Performance*) and feedback (*Provide Feedback*) is an important element to support long-term retention and understanding. However, most videos seem to only present passive content without optimizing for those two elements. In fact, the comment column can be a space for reflection, questions and answers, and clarification of material for students. The impact on the teaching process of *Maharah Istima'* is quite significant. When students are only passive spectators with no room to practice or get feedback, then the ability to listen does not develop optimally. *Maharah Istima'* is not just about listening, but also requires an understanding of meaning, context, and active practice of pronunciation and interpretation. This data shows that learning videos need to be more designed to be not only visually or algorithmically appealing, but also pedagogically robust.

To answer this problem, there are several concrete solutions that can be applied. First, each video should clearly state the learning objectives (*Inform Learners of Objectives*) so that students know the direction of learning. Second, insert short exercises or questions during the video to encourage students to think and interact (*Elicit Performance*). Third, activate and moderate the comment column to accommodate questions or reflections from students, as well as provide space for teachers to respond (*Provide Feedback*). Fourth, apply the *flipped classroom learning model*, where students watch videos outside the classroom, and discussion or evaluation activities are carried out directly with the teacher. Finally, optimize video dissemination techniques with the right YouTube strategies such as engaging thumbnails, relevant tags, and educational descriptions, so that YouTube's algorithm supports the reach and usefulness of your videos to the fullest.

Table 4 illustrates that the high video views are not always directly proportional to the quality of pedagogy or the level of user interaction. With the application of effective learning design principles, especially based on the Gagné model, Arabic learning videos can be improved in quality so that they are not only popular, but also instructively meaningful in developing *Maharah Istima'* skills.

## Conclusion

Based on the results of the analysis of *At-Ta'aruf-themed* Arabic learning videos on YouTube using *Gagné's Nine Events of Instruction model*, it can be concluded that most of the videos do not fully meet the nine stages of Gagné's learning in their entirety. Elements such as *presenting content*, *learning guidance*, and *assessment* have generally appeared in videos. However, some crucial stages, such as *explicitly informing learners of objectives* and *stimulating recall of prior learning*, are often overlooked. This shows that although the popularity of videos (judging by the number of impressions, likes, and comments) is quite high, its pedagogical quality is still not consistent or systematic.

This research has contributed to demonstrating the importance of instructional frameworks in assessing and designing digital learning videos, especially for language learning. The Gagné model has proven to be effective in identifying the strengths and weaknesses of learning content, and can be used as a reference in improving the effectiveness of video-based learning media. However, this study has limitations, especially in the aspect of subjectivity in assessing the fulfillment of the Gagné stage, as well as the limited number of videos analyzed. Therefore, the generalization of these findings must be done carefully and contextually.

It is recommended that learning content creators pay attention to all stages in the Gagné model when designing videos, in order to improve the instructional quality and



learning experience of learners. Researchers are then expected to use a wider and more diverse video sample and develop more objective and standardized assessment instruments. In addition, instructional design-based training such as the Gagné model can also be an effective strategy to improve the quality of digital learning content in the future.

## Acknowledgment

We sincerely thank the Almighty God, whose grace has made it possible for this endeavor to be completed successfully. Our deep appreciation also goes to our supervising lecturers for their valuable guidance and insightful feedback throughout the research process. Lastly, we are grateful to everyone who contributed to and supported this study in any way.

## References

- Agazio, J., & Buckley, K. M. (2009). An Untapped Resource: Using Youtube In Nursing Education. *Nurse Educator*, 34(1), 23–28.
- Coal, H. H., & Coal, D. S. (2020). The use of video tutorials to support online learning during the coronavirus pandemic. *Muallimuna: Journal of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, 5(2), 74–84.
- Berger-Estilita, J., & Greif, R. (2020). Using Gagné's "Instructional Design" To Teach Clinically Applicable Knowledge In Small Groups. *Trends In Anaesthesia And Critical Care*, 35, 11–15.
- Cahyana, A. D., & Kosasih, E. (2021). Analysis of the feasibility of learning videos for elementary school levels on Ruangguru Youtube Channel and Labedu Channel. *COLLASE (Creative Of Learning Students Elementary Education)*, 4(4), 492–500.
- Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. (2008). The Qualitative Content Analysis Process. *Journal Of Advanced Nursing*, 62(1), 107–115.
- Fawzani, N., Firdaus, & Akmal. (2022). The Relationship of Arabic Songs with Maharah Istima' Students. *Naskhi Journal: Journal of Education and Arabic Language Studies*, 4, 32–39. <https://doi.org/10.47435/Naskhi.V4i2.1214>
- Gagne, R. M., Briggs, L. J., & Wager, W. (1992). Principles Of Instructional Design (4e Éd.). New York, NY Holt, Rinehart Winst.
- Handayani, S. & Syafi'i. (2022). The Utilization of Youtube Animation Videos to Increase the Development of Maharah Istima' Arabic. *Tatsqifiy: Journal of Arabic Language Education*, 3, 104–115. <https://doi.org/10.30997/Tjpba.V3i2.6138>
- Immanuel, J., & Hameed, M. M. S. (2023). Cognitive Theory Of Multimedia Learning Powered Code-Switching Interface For Vocabulary Acquisition Of ESL Students. *Journal Of Language Teaching And Research*, 14(6), 1439–1448.
- Khadjooi, K., Rostami, K., & Ishaq, S. (2011). How To Use Gagne's Model Of Instructional Design In Teaching Psychomotor Skills. *Gastroenterology And Hepatology From Bed To Bench*, 4(3), 116.
- Latifah, N., Hasan, N., & Fitria, Y. A. (2020). Development of Sparkol Videoscribe Learning Media for the Writing Skills of Grade IV Students of Sdn Sukamurni 1 Tangerang Regency. *Muallimuna: Journal of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, 6(1), 40–48.
- Lo, W.-L., & Hsieh, M.-C. (2020). Teaching Communication Skills: Using Gagne's Model As An Illustration. *Tzu Chi Medical Journal*, 32(1), 19–25.

- Lolang, E., Andilolo, J., & Silka, S. (2023). Feasibility Analysis of Physics Learning Videos on the Vibration and Wave Material Youtube Platform for Grade VIII Junior High School. *Journal of Physics Learning Research*, 14(1), 119–124.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*. Sage.
- Ozsaban, A., & Bayram, A. (2024). A Content Validity, Reliability And Quality Analysis Of Peripheral Intravenous Catheterization Videos On Youtube™. *The Journal Of Vascular Access*, 25, 1885–1893. <https://doi.org/10.1177/11297298231186374>
- Pérez, M., Pesek, I., Zmazek, B., & Lipovec, A. (2020). Video Explanations As A Useful Digital Source Of Education In The COVID 19 Situation. *Revija Za Elementarno Izobraževanje*, 13, 395–412. <https://doi.org/10.18690/Rei.13.4.395-412.2020>
- Richey, R. C. (2000). The Future Role Of Robert M. Gagné In Instructional Design. *The Legacy Of Robert M. Gagne*, 255, 281.
- Sari, L. (2020). Efforts to improve the quality of education by using Youtube as a teaching medium during the Covid-19 pandemic. *Journal of Psychiatry*, 4(1), 1074–1084.
- Setiawan, T. Y., Arsil, A., & Noviyanti, S. (2021). *The Use of Youtube in the Learning System in the Network during the Covid-19 Pandemic in Elementary School Class IIC*.
- Sopian, A., & Tatang, N. N. (2023). Development of Digital Teaching Materials in the Era of the Industrial Revolution 4.0 for Arabic Language Teachers in Subang Regency. *Journal of Education and Community Service*, 6(4), 218–223.
- Wahyudin, W. (2020). Teaching the skill of listening as a model for non-native speakers. *IJ-ATL (International Journal Of Arabic Teaching And Learning)*, 3, 61–75. <https://doi.org/10.33650/Ijatl.V3i2.1068>